



**Legislative Assembly  
Province of Alberta**

No. 36

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

---

---

Thursday, May 4, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

**Presenting Petitions**

Mr. Johnson, Hon. Member for Wetaskiwin-Camrose, presented a petition from 65 Albertans supporting the reinstatement of front licence plates on all vehicles registered in Alberta.

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, presented a petition from 180 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, presented a petition from 32 Calgary residents requesting that the Government use its legislative powers to help resolve the labour dispute at the Calgary Herald.

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, presented a petition from 171 Albertans urging the Government to maintain Kananaskis in a natural state, deny development approval to any intensive recreational developments, and create a Wildland Provincial Park.

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, presented a petition from 162 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, presented a petition from 80 Edmonton residents in support of the five basic principles upon which medicare was built.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 40 Calgary residents requesting that the Government use its legislative powers to help resolve the labour dispute at the Calgary Herald.

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, presented a petition from 160 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 111 Calgary residents requesting that the Government use its legislative powers to help resolve the labour dispute at the Calgary Herald.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 664 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Mr. McFarland, Hon. Member for Little Bow, presented a petition from 87 Albertans supporting the reinstatement of front licence plates on all vehicles registered in Alberta.

Mr. Tannas, Hon. Member for Highwood, presented a petition from 46 Albertans supporting the reinstatement of front licence plates on all vehicles registered in Alberta.

Mr. Severtson, Hon. Member for Innisfail-Sylvan Lake, presented a petition from 20 Innisfail and Sylvan Lake residents supporting the reinstatement of front licence plates on all vehicles registered in Alberta.

### **Reading and Receiving Petitions**

On request by Mr. Trynchy, Hon. Member for Whitecourt-Ste. Anne, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to reinstate the front licence plate on all vehicles registered in Alberta.

On request by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government to take an enlightened preventative approach and add the newer and more effective medications and therapies to the Alberta drug list to ensure the health of an aging society.

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned, ask the Assembly to petition the Government to use its legislative powers to help resolve the labour dispute at the Calgary Herald.

On request by Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the Province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to pass a bill banning private for-profit hospitals in Alberta so that the integrity of the public, universal health care system may be maintained.

## **Tabling Returns and Reports**

Hon. Mr. Lund, Minister of Agriculture, Food and Rural Development:

Letter dated May 3, 2000, from Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, to The Right Honourable Jean Chrétien, Prime Minister, expressing concern regarding the increase by the Canadian Transportation Agency of railway grain freight rates and urging the Federal Government to implement the recommendations made by Justice Estey and Mr. Kroeger regarding the farming industry

Sessional Paper 807/2000

Hon. Mr. Dunford, Minister of Human Resources and Employment:

Return to Order of the Assembly Motion for Return MR46 asked for by Mrs. Soetaert on behalf of Mrs. Sloan on May 3, 2000:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:  
Copies of requests for proposals for employment program initiatives designed for Assured Income for the Severely Handicapped and Assured Support Program recipients since February 28, 1999.

Sessional Paper 808/2000

Hon. Mr. Stelmach, Minister of Infrastructure:

List of new health facility projects and health facility renovation projects from 1992-93 to February 2000

Sessional Paper 809/2000

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition:

Letter dated April 26, 2000, from Moe Hamdon, Mayor, Town of Drayton Valley, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, stating that a resolution had been passed by the Drayton Valley Town Council at its meeting of April 26, 2000, indicating concerns regarding the future direction of health care in Alberta and Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, in its present form

Sessional Paper 810/2000

Globe and Mail Newspaper article dated May 4, 2000, entitled "True confessions: a left-wing nut bares all" prepared by Leah Lawrence, expressing concerns regarding comments made by Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, in relation to protesters of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, and expressing concerns regarding Bill 11

Sessional Paper 811/2000

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Document dated May 4, 2000, entitled "Alberta vs. Ontario: Who really has the lowest personal income tax rate?" setting out income tax information for Alberta and Ontario in the 2001 taxation year, and attached excerpt from the Treasury Ministry Business Plan setting out a performance measure regarding personal income tax load

Sessional Paper 812/2000

Two 2000 Ontario Budget Backgrounders entitled "Personal Income Tax Cuts in the 2000 Ontario Budget" and "'Made for Ontario' Tax System" setting out information regarding changes to income tax rules in the 2000 Ontario budget

Sessional Paper 813/2000

E-mail message dated April 26, 2000, from Scott Kennie, Sherwood Park, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing concerns about health care funding levels and Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, and urging the Premier to call a provincial election prior to passing Bill 11

Sessional Paper 814/2000

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

Letter dated May 3, 2000, from Harold Moore to the Progressive Conservative Caucus and Mr. Clegg, Hon. Member for Dunvegan, requesting them to vote against Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 815/2000

Alberta RN (Registered Nurse) newsletter article, dated March/April 2000, entitled "President's Update-What's wrong with Bill 11?"

Sessional Paper 816/2000

Letter dated April 7, 2000, from T. Murray Rankin, Q.C., to Stan Marshall, Senior Research Officer, Canadian Union of Public Employees, reviewing a memo prepared by Professor Levy for Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, regarding the Canada Health Act and Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 817/2000

Internet Net News Inc. article summary dated May 5, 2000, entitled "Who approved CLS (Calgary Laboratory Services)?" prepared by Donna Korchinski, journalist

Sessional Paper 818/2000

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

E-mail message dated April 20, 2000, from Karen Palmer, Board Member, Physicians for a National Health Program (PNHP), to Dr. Swanson, enclosing a press release regarding the quality of for-profit hospitals versus not for-profit hospitals, prepared by Gordon Schiff, M.D., Past President, PNHP

Sessional Paper 819/2000

Web site containing a public inquiry poll regarding the evidence of conflicting interests at the Calgary Regional Health Authority (CRHA), and the need for a public inquiry into the CRHA's operations

Sessional Paper 820/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

E-mail message dated May 3, 2000, from David McVean, Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing concerns regarding the motion to close debate on Committee of the Whole consideration of, and asking questions about, Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 821/2000

Fax dated May 4, 2000, from Ruth Vander Woude, Edmonton, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, and Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, requesting the withdrawal of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 822/2000

Letter dated May 4, 2000, from Astrid Blodgett, Edmonton, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing concerns regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 823/2000

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

E-mail message dated May 2, 2000, from Irene Rheinwald, Edmonton, to Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 824/2000

Thesis dated September 29, 1999, entitled "The Role of Changing Together: A Centre for Immigrant Women in the Well-being of its clientele; A Qualitative Evaluation" prepared by Katharine Ruth Hibbard, M.Sc., University of Alberta  
Sessional Paper 825/2000

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert:

5 letters, undated, from Doug Thomson, Mark Pouliot, Edmonton, Tenille Harasewich, Linda Harasewich, and Leona Sambor, all of Spruce Grove, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, and Members of the Legislative Assembly, expressing opposition to the proposal to allow Regional Health Authorities to enter into contractual arrangements with private for-profit hospitals

Sessional Paper 826/2000

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry:

Letter dated February 25, 2000, from Allan P. Jobson, Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, requesting an investigation regarding Mr. Jobson's application for out-of-country funding in addition to the basic coverage provided by the Alberta Health Care Insurance Plan, with attached WCB (Workers' Compensation Board) appeals commission package

Sessional Paper 827/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

Letter dated April 24, 2000, from David W. Poulton, Conservation Director, Calgary/Banff Chapter, Canadian Parks and Wilderness Society, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, and Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Environment, with attached petition from 68 Albertans expressing support for the permanent protection of the Spray and Kananaskis Valleys and opposition to any developments in the Spray Valley

Sessional Paper 828/2000

2 letters dated March 5, 2000, from Kristian Kiml and Ken Topham, both of Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to the development of the Spray Valley in Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 829/2000

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

Letter dated May 2, 2000, from Hon. Mr. Paszkowski, Minister of Municipal Affairs, to Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, in response to Mr. MacDonald's letter dated April 13, 2000, concerning the Power Engineers' registration fee providing cost recovery for services delivered to the Power Engineers' program

Sessional Paper 830/2000

E-mail message dated April 13, 2000, from Naomi Lakritz, striking Calgary Herald worker, to Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, urging the Government to use its legislative powers to assist striking Calgary Herald workers in obtaining their first collective agreement

Sessional Paper 831/2000

## **Oral Question Period**

During Oral Question Period, Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, tabled the following:

Document dated November 12, 1998, entitled "Calgary Regional Health Authority Pilot Study: Evaluation of Contracted Surgical Services"

Sessional Paper 832/2000

During Oral Question Period, Hon. Dr. West, Acting Provincial Treasurer, tabled the following:

Proposed Government amendments to Bill 18, Personal Income Tax Act

Sessional Paper 833/2000

During Oral Question Period, Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, stated Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, would be addressing a Point of Privilege on his behalf as a result of questions raised by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert.

## **Members' Statements**

Mrs. O'Neill, Hon. Member for St. Albert, made a statement regarding The Canadian Association of Statutory Human Rights Agencies who will be hosting a conference May 7-9, 2000, in Banff, to discuss human rights trends and issues that shape Canadian society and culture.

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, made a statement regarding Lawrence Grassi Middle School in Canmore for writing more than 100 letters to elected officials asking for a halt to proposed additional development in the Spray Lakes area, for an end to grizzly hunting, and for the recognition of grizzlies as an endangered species.

During Members' Statements, Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, tabled the following:

Petition from Lawrence Grassi Middle School students, Canmore, requesting the Government to take a number of steps to protect wildlife and their environment

Sessional Paper 834/2000

Ms Fritz, Hon. Member for Calgary-Cross, made a statement congratulating Nortel Networks in Calgary for their upcoming 200,000 square foot expansion to its west wing campus.

## Projected Government Business

Pursuant to Standing Order 7(5), Ms Carlson, Acting Official Opposition House Leader, asked a question pertaining to the order of Government Business to be brought before the Assembly for the following week.

Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, gave notice of projected Government Business for the week of May 8 to May 12, 2000:

Monday, May 8	Aft.	- <b>Government Bills and Orders</b> <b>Second Reading</b> Bill 19, 16, 20 <b>Third Reading</b> Bill 11 And as per Order Paper
	Eve.	- <b>Government Bills and Orders</b> <b>Second Reading</b> Bill 16, 19 <b>Third Reading</b> Bill 11 And as per Order Paper
Tuesday, May 9	(4:30)	- <b>Private Bills</b> <b>Second Reading</b> Bill Pr3 <b>Committee of the Whole</b> Bill Pr1, Pr3, Pr2, Pr4, Pr5 <b>Third Reading</b> Bill Pr1, Pr3, Pr2, Pr4, Pr5 <b>Government Bills and Orders</b> Government Motion 18 And as per Order Paper



	Eve.	- <b>Government Bills and Orders</b> <b>Committee of the Whole</b> Bill 17, 3, 13, 15 <b>Third Reading</b> Bill 11 And as per Order Paper
Wednesday, May 10	Eve.	- <b>Government Bills and Orders</b> <b>Committee of the Whole</b> based on progress Tuesday <b>Third Reading</b> Bill 11 And as per Order Paper
Thursday, May 11	Aft.	- <b>Government Bills and Orders</b> <b>Committee of the Whole</b> based on progress Wednesday <b>Third Reading</b> Bill 11 And as per Order Paper

### **Point of Privilege**

On behalf of Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, raised a question of privilege under Standing Order 15, regarding questions raised by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, with respect to the site chosen for the new Peace River Hospital.

Mr. Speaker heard from Mr. Sapers, the Hon. Acting Opposition House Leader, and Mr. Friedel, Hon. Member for Peace River.

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, apologized to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, Members of the Legislative Assembly, and to the former owner of the Peace River Hospital site.

## **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

### **Government Bills and Orders**

#### **Second Reading**

The following Bills were read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill 15 Business Corporations Amendment Act, 2000 — Mr. Melchin

Bill 17 Fair Trading Amendment Act, 2000 — Mr. Ducharme

#### **Adjournment**

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 5:12 p.m. until Monday, May 8, 2000, at 1:30 p.m.

---

---

Hon. Ken Kowalski,  
Speaker

Title: Thursday, May 4, 2000